

article fira

by Article Fira Article Fira

Submission date: 29-Jul-2023 06:21AM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 2138226823

File name: artikel_firzuh_SEMHAS-stlh_revisi.docx (60.72K)

Word count: 4368

Character count: 23566

The Power of Picture Series in ELT to Improve Senior High School Student's Writing Skills

Fira Zuhria¹⁾, Vidya Mandarani^{*2)}

¹⁾Program Studi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Universitas Muhammadiyah Sidoarjo, Indonesia

*Email Penulis Korespondensi: vmandarani@umsida.ac.id

Abstract: The objective of the research is to identify whether the use of media picture series can improve students' writing skills in narrative text. The research conducted in class X-1 at SMA Kemala Bhayangkari 3 Porong. The research purpose to increase students' creativity in their writing skills and can provide media variations in ELT. The research method was quantitative with a pre-experimental design. The result of research shows that the picture series gives a significant improvement in the results of the mean score pre-test was 72.80 with the mean post-test score being 83.83. It can be seen from the Pair-sample T Test output table with the result of the value of sig. (2-tailed) in this study is 0.000. Therefore, it shows that picture series media is effective in English Learning Teaching to improve the writing skills of narrative texts for class X-1 SMA Kemala Bhayangkari students. Give a media picture series, the students got a learning experience so that learning is interesting and increase student's creativity. The implication of this research is picture series is recommended in English Language Teaching to improve the writing skills.

Keywords - writing; picture series; narrative text

Abstrak: Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengidentifikasi penggunaan media gambar seri dapat meningkatkan keterampilan menulis teks naratif siswa. Penelitian dilakukan di kelas X-1 SMA Kemala Bhayangkari 3 Porong. Tujuan penelitian untuk meningkatkan kreativitas siswa dalam keterampilan menulis dan dapat memberikan variasi media dalam ELT. Metode penelitian adalah kuantitatif dengan desain pre-experimental. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa gambar seri memberikan peningkatan yang signifikan pada hasil rata-rata skor pretes adalah 72,80 dengan rata-rata skor postes menjadi 83,83. Hal ini dapat dilihat dari tabel output Pair-sample T Test dengan hasil nilai sig. (2-tailed) dalam penelitian ini adalah 0,000. Oleh karena itu, hal ini menunjukkan bahwa media gambar berseri efektif dalam Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris untuk meningkatkan keterampilan menulis teks naratif siswa di kelas X-1 SMA Kemala Bhayangkari. Memberikan media gambar seri, siswa mendapatkan pengalaman belajar sehingga pembelajaran menjadi menarik dan meningkatkan kreativitas siswa. Implikasi dari penelitian ini adalah gambar seri direkomendasikan dalam Pengajaran Bahasa Inggris untuk meningkatkan keterampilan menulis.

Kata kunci: menulis, gambar seri, teks naratif

I. Introduction

In the learning process of English teaching, four skills must be acquired by students. The four skills are listening, speaking, reading, and writing. One difficult skill that needs acquired skill by students is writing[1]. Students must give their full attention to writing. As stated by Richards and Renandya, there is no doubt that writing is the hardest skill for learners to master[2]. Writing is an important skill to learn as a language component because it connects to other language-related concepts. Students in senior high school expected to have a strong command of the English language and participate actively in the learning process by writing in English[3].

For senior high school students, writing skills are very required. Students should focus on improving their writing skills because it is a useful to learn. However, the majority of Indonesian students studying English as a second language believe that learning writing is the most difficult skill to learn. As stated by Rahma, et.al, Students encounter various difficulties when writing since it involves complicated elements that must be included, like arranging ideas and choosing appropriate vocabulary, mechanics, and grammar rules[4]. It shows that writing is a challenging skill.

Writing is an expression of our thinking. Through writing, students can express their thoughts, feelings, opinions, and ideas about certain events[5]. According to Harmer, writing is a complex skill[6]. Before presenting ideas in their writing, students should have accurate information, strong arguments, and a thorough knowledge of writing structure and techniques. Students are required to structure their ideas into phrases, sentences, and paragraphs. Therefore, students need practice to master this skill. For English language learners, it is imperative to remember that writing is a process rather than a final result. Teaching and learning activities are the most crucial component of the learning process in schools since they improve students' skills. According to Romadlona, et al, The learning process that students go through determines whether educational objectives are met successfully or unsuccessfully[7]. Writing

is a skill that includes conveying ideas, and teaching it is ultimately necessary because communication not only through speaking skills but also through writing skills.

Based on the pre-interview with one of the English teachers from the school, the X-1 grade SMA Bhayangkari 3 Porong is an active class but does not have writing skills. Students have a basic understanding of the types of text and the teacher only gave exercises related to the text they have studied. Based on the incident, students have had little opportunity to improve their writing skills. The lack of students' writing skills often arises from the limited media available to practice their writing skills. It will also impact low motivation and lack of confidence in their writing abilities[8]. Even though, the students need to learn and master language skills including writing skills. According to Simorangkir, et al., Students are aware of their inability to write well, and this phenomenon may be the result of school that was less focusing less focus on teaching and learning to write[9].

Providing a variety of English Learning Teaching will help students to improve student's writing skills. The teachers are the ones who have the most effect on students' ability to learn English[10]. The methods used by the teacher in English language teaching will help the students learn in class. The use of interest and appropriate media is one of the ways for teachers to increase student creativity in writing skills. As stated by Halim and Arifin, teachers need to consider various kinds of media that can expose students to more concrete teaching since the combination of learning media can implement for learning appear innovative teaching and provide students with a more meaningful experience[11].

The researchers have a solution to the problem based on the issues that the teacher raised. A Method refers to the provision of media in learning. When teachers teach English as a foreign language, various methods can be used to teach students in class. One of the varieties of English teaching media is to provide learning media. It can encourage and motivate students in the learning process. Through the learning media used by the teacher can help to create their ideas. Media will help students with the writing they are going to write. The researcher focuses on the media method for providing them with picture series. Giving picture series to students is consider as an effective method to improve their writing skills[12]. The reason is that the strategy can be crucial to improv students' writing skills. According to Dewi, et al, the picture series learning method is unique for its emphasis on activity, innovation, creativity, and fun[13]. The use media of picture series can organize a sequence of events in chronological order and their writing systematic or coherent. The support stated by Wright, picture series can encourage students to develop their creativity by helping them to connect various events as illustrated in the pictures and then create stories out of them[14].

Text are divided into four types in writing skills, narrative, description, argument, and exposition. The researchers focused on how to write using narrative text. Teachers teaching in narrative texts to tell them about fiction writing in the form of short stories, fairy tales, novels, and stories that want to entertain readers and learn from them. According to Oshima, et al., narrative story writing aims to tell events in a chronological sequence wherein things occur and sentences are organized[15]. Stories generally contain incidents. An event can qualify as a story if something changes from the way it started. A sequence of events can be characterized as a narrative. The support stated by Simorangkir, et al., narrative texts describe a story that has a chronology or a sequence of particular events, and picture series can be used to convey a topic or the story of a story in narrative text[9]. So providing picture series media using narrative text in English language teaching, the students can see the sign illustrated by the picture to express an idea[16].

Previous research did by Eliyawati, et al., conducted on first-grade students at MTs SA Daruth Thalibin Bangilan Tuban used descriptive text to learn writing skills[17]. The implementation in their research was the researchers and teacher gave picture series in learning to write descriptive text by students. In addition the research did by Cristine, conducted on the eighth-grade SMPN1 Malinau Barat used recount text to learn writing skills[18]. The implementation of picture series in her research was students arranged several the sentence based on the pictures given. Novelty in this research is teaching writing narrative text using picture series in ELT in the X-1 grade at SMA Bhayangkari 3 Porong. Through give picture series, the students develop verbs that have been given into narrative sentences according to their creativity. The picture series will be used in the X-1 grade at SMA Bhayangkari 3 Porong because the English teacher has not used the picture series as a method of English Teaching Learning in school. The researchers conducted at SMA Kemala Bhayangkari, it is expected using picture series, the teacher can provide media variations in ELT to improve student's writing skills. Furthermore, the researchers expected using media picture series can increase student's creativity to improve their writing skills. Thus, the focus of this research is the effectiveness of use media picture series in writing skill of students' narrative text.

II. Methodology

The researchers focused on improving writing skills to write narrative text using picture series. The method used in this research is quantitative research with a pre-experimental design. According to Silalahi, et al, quantitative research refers to detailed, accurate coding counts that can be quantified after data collection[19]. The data as the measure of effectiveness of using picture series to increase student's creativity writing narrative text skills is taken

1

from experiment one group. As stated by Vanesa and Setiawati, the research quantitative methodology was employed to test how well students could write using pictures and the data results contain numerical data for analysis and statistical testing[20].

The research was conducted at SMA Kemala Bhayangkari 3 Porong. The results of the pre-interview there were classes X-1 to X-12. The population of this research is class X which consists of 468 students. The data is gathered from samples not from the population as a whole. based on the researchers needs, the researchers used a sample is a subset of the population to gather data. The sample was the students of class X-1 which consists of 39 students. The class was a recommendation from the English teacher in SMA Kemala Bhayangkari 3 Porong.

In the pre-experimental design, the researchers chose a group experiment to give the picture series treatment. The one group of experiments was the student's X1 class at SMA Kemala Bhayangkari 3 Porong. The teaching method carried out is giving pre-test, treatment, and post-test to students[21]. The support stated by Creswell, Pre-experiment design is a pre-test assessment accompanied by a treatment and post-test for a single group[22].

The instruments used to conduct research were pre-test and post test, lesson plans, and media picture series. Researchers validated all instruments by experts before conducting treatment in class. The class gave treatment (X) after the pre-test (01) has been carried out. While the post-test (02) was tested after the class was given the media picture series treatment. The pre-test and post-test used questions about a narrative text. The students wrote narrative texts according to instructions on the answer sheet, namely the text contains at least 3 paragraphs consisting of orientation, complications, and resolution, and each paragraph is at least eight sentences. The data is taken form the result students wrote narrative text in given worksheet.

Data collection was carried out after the instrument about media picture series in ELT has been implemented. The researchers scored worksheet's students based rubric assessment writing. As stated by Jacobs, et al, scored the based on five aspects of other analytical scales of writing composition which are: content, organization, vocabulary, language use, and mechanics[23]. The data was collected and calculated using SPSS. Analyzing data using SPSS is the process of finding answers or research problems that have been formulated by researchers. The difference between before and after treatments responsible for the changes and the effects are known after collected data. The result was known how effective the use of media picture series in ELT.

III. Finding and Discussion

Finding

The researchers conducted a pre-test at the beginning of the learning process intending to know the student's initial before getting the learning treatment. After the students did the pre-test, at the next meeting the students were given a picture series treatment and a post test was carried out to find out the ability of students after getting treatment using the picture series. The result student's worksheet scored based 5 aspect, there were content, organization, language use vocabulary, and mechanics. The writing test before and after the picture series treatment gathered to analyze. The researchers used SPSS 23 version. It presents the research findings and analysis as a result of the study. The first data is descriptive data statistics include minimum score, minimal score, maximal score, and standard deviation. The results descriptive statistics can be seen in Table 1.

Table 1. Descriptive statistics

| | N | Minimum | Maximum | Mean | Std. Deviation |
|--------------------|----|---------|---------|-------|----------------|
| pretest | 30 | 50 | 88 | 72.80 | 7.902 |
| posttest | 30 | 75 | 90 | 83.83 | 5.086 |
| Valid N (listwise) | 30 | | | | |

The table above shows that there is an improvement in students' writing narrative text using picture series. It is shown from pre-test mean score 72.80, the highest score is 88, and the lowest score is 50. while, the mean score of the post-test is 83.83, the highest score is 90, and the lowest score is 75.

Before of the sample t-test, it is necessary it is necessary to carry out a normality test first. This normality test aims to determine the results of the pre-test and the post test that has been obtained is normally distributed.

Table 2 below contains normality test data because this data has the same n = number of students. Therefore, the formula that has been used is Kolmogorov-Smirnov. Calculation of the normality test of 4 is data is stated normally distributed if the value is $\text{sig} > 0.05$ and if the value is $\text{sig} < 0.05$ then the data is said to be not normally distributed.

Table 2. The normality test

One-Sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test

| | | Unstandardized Residual |
|----------------------------------|----------------|-------------------------|
| N | | 30 |
| Normal Parameters ^{a,b} | Mean | .0000000 |
| | Std. Deviation | 7.59637510 |
| Most Extreme Differences | Absolute | .155 |
| | Positive | .111 |
| | Negative | -.155 |
| Test Statistic | | .155 |
| Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed) | | .065 ^c |

a. Test distribution is Normal.

b. Calculated from data.

c. Lilliefors Significance Correction.

As seen in Table 2 above, based on the normality test using the Kolmogorov Smirnov test, the critical value was 0.65. Then, the data is declared normal because the data value obtained $\text{sig} > 0.05$.

The t-test was used in order to make an inferential conclusion regarding the effectiveness of picture series in English Language Teaching. If value $\text{sig} (2\text{-tailed}) < 0.05$ then H_0 is rejected and H_{11} is accepted, which means that there is effectiveness in the use of picture series on student's writing skills. If the value is $\text{sig} (2\text{-tailed}) > 0.05$ then H_0 is accepted and H_a is rejected, which means there is no effect on the use of picture series on student's writing skills. Table 3 below contains the data of t-test.

Table 3. Paired sample t-test

| Pair | | Paired Differences | | | | | t | df | Sig. (2-tailed) |
|------|--------------------|--------------------|----------------|------------|-------------------------------------------|--------|-------|----|-----------------|
| | | Mean | Std. Deviation | Std. Error | 95% Confidence Interval of the Difference | | | | |
| | | | | Mean | Lower | Upper | | | |
| 1 | pretest - posttest | - | 8.135 | 1.485 | -14.071 | -7.996 | - | 29 | .000 |
| | | 11.033 | | | | | 7.429 | | |

Table 3 shows the value of Sig (2 tailed) is $0.000 < 0.05$, this shows that there is a significant difference in the average pre-test and post-test scores between before the picture series treatment is taught and after students are taught using the picture series. Accordingly, t_{6} Critical value of the data is 7.429. Meanwhile, the degree of freedom is 29. So that interpretation can be made that the use of picture series has a major effect on student's writing skills in class X1 SMA Kemala Bhayangkari 3 Porong.

Discussion

In accordance with the results of research conducted, the presentation of data obtained by researchers namely the pre-test and post test that have been planned by the researchers. The treatment picture series has been the focus of research on students' skills to write narrative texts for class X1 SMA Kemala Bhayangkari 3 Porong. According to

the requirements of this study, the researchers discussed the findings of the data analysis of the pre-test and post test. The discussion is intended to determine the effect of media picture series to improve students' writing skills in narrative text. The research objective are the teacher can provide media variations in ELT to improve student's writing skills and media picture series can increase student's creativity to improve their writing skills.

The data is taken from one group experiment writing in form of narrative text. In class X1, a pre-test was carried out, there were 39 experimental worksheets. After that in the post test there are 33 worksheets from the collection of student's worksheets. Based on the pre-experimental type of quantitative research method, the researcher took thirty student worksheets at random. The students' writings of narrative text are scored based narrative text assessment rubric in the lesson plan. It consists of content, organization, grammar, vocabulary, and mechanics.

The pre-test is given in order to know the students' score writing skills in narrative text before give a treatment. The researchers found that students having trouble developing sentences. Then the second test is given post-test to students. The students have been given treatment. The treatment of using media picture series was proven after the students carried out the post test to write narrative text better than before and that showing improvement.

Based on the analysis of the experimental one group's pre-test and post test data, then the researcher found that there was an improve student's writing skills narrative after being given treatment using picture series. It can be seen from the difference in the mean score of the pre-test was (72.80), and the post test score was (83.83). The normality test in SPSS has a criterion. The normality test indicates the value was > 0.05 , which means that the data normally distributed, the critical value was 0.65. Then, paired sample T-test shows (H_0) is accepted because the data's significance level was 0.000, which is less than of 0.005. The results of the data analysis showed that the treatment with picture series media had a significant effect on students' writing skills.

Based on the results of the implementation of picture series media of student X-1, that picture series media provides variations in teaching English. Previous research did by Fitri, et al, that picture series was more effectively used in teaching writing procedural texts and can increase the content, the organization, and the grammar of the students' writing at senior high school[24]. In addition, this research had an effect on students' writing skills. The researchers concluded the media picture series increased student's creativity in writing narrative text because the students can develop verbs that have been given into narrative sentences according to their creativity. Previous research did by Ramadhanty, et al, the result of their study used showed that there was significant effect that increased students' skills to write an English descriptive writing at the secondary level of school of used picture series[25]. The picture series can use by the teacher in types in writing, there are description, argument, and exposition especially narrative text. Therefore, the implication of this research is picture series is recommended in English Language Teaching to improve the writing skills.

IV. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the data analysis in the previous chapters, picture series gave significant improvement in the results of the pre-test and post test, with the mean post test score being 83.83. The mean score on the pre-test, which was 72.80, is higher compared to the current one. This is evidenced by the analysis of the t-test pre-test and post test student's writing skills. It can be seen from the Pair-sample T Test output table with the result of the value of sig.(2-tailed) in this study is 0.000. The reason for decision-making is shown in the Pair-sample T Test output table sig.(2-tailed) < 0.05 then H_0 is rejected so H_a is accepted. Therefore, that it can be said that picture series is effective in English Learning Teaching on the skills of writing narrative texts for class X1 SMA Kemala Bhayangkari students. The students were fun and enthusiastic when the picture series used in learning media. In the interest of improving students' writing skills, the researchers suggested that English teachers use learning media in teaching writing. For the students, it is suggested that they keep on writing. They should always have a good motivation in learning. To improve their writing habits, students should always practice writing sentences, paragraphs, and eventually texts.

References:

- [1] S. Fahmi and C. Rachmijati, "Improving Students' Writing Skill Using Grammatly Application for Second Grade in Senior High School," *Proj. (Professional J. English Educ.*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 69–74, 2021, doi: 10.22460/project.v4i1.p69-74.
- [2] W. A. R. Jack C. Richards, *Methodology in Language Teaching: An Anthology of Current Practice*, vol. 69, no. 1. Cambridge University Press, 2002. doi: 10.2307/416467.
- [3] M. Husna, "Application of The Picture and Picture Learning Model to Improve the Student's Writing Ability in Class IV," *stinu al hikmah Sekol. Tinggi Ilmu Tarb. Nahdlatul Ulama Al Hikmah Mojokerto*, vol. 6, pp. 536–550, 2022.

- [4] E. A. Rahma, S. S. Fitriani, and R. Syafitri, "Students' Perception to the Use of Indirect Corrective Feedback in Writing Recount Text," *Int. J. Educ. Lang. Relig.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 25–30, 2020, doi: 10.35308/ijelr.v2i1.2222.
- [5] M. Misa, "Writing Recount Text : A Case Study of Grammatical Errors of ELT Classroom at 10th Grade Students," *Budapest Int. Res. Critics Institute-Journal*, vol. 5, pp. 31542–31549, 2022.
- [6] J. Harmer, *Learning the Language of Practice*, 4th ed. Pearson Longman ELT, 2007. doi: 10.1080/03626784.1987.11075294.
- [7] H. M. Romadlona and Z. A. Khofshoh, "The Effectiveness of Using Picture Series Media On Student's Writing Narrative Text," *J. Kependidikan, Pembelajaran, dan Pengemb.*, vol. 05, no. 01, pp. 30–35, 2023.
- [8] D. Faiza and M. H. Mayekti, "Fiction Writing in Wattpad As a Learning Media for Improving the Students' Writing Skill in English Language Teaching Department Unu Purwokerto," *Edulingua J. Linguist. Terap. dan Pendidik. Bhs. Ingg.*, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 1–12, 2022, doi: 10.34001/edulingua.v9i1.2515.
- [9] R. W. P. Simorangkir, S. M. N. Simamora, L. S. Manurung, D. L. Simbolon, and S. Napitupulu, "the Effectiveness Using Picture and Picture Media To Solve Senior High School Problem in Writing Skill of Narrative Text at 10th Grade SMAN 1 Pematang Siantar," *Multiscience*, no. December, pp. 36–49, 2022.
- [10] P. Azhar, A. Majid, K. Rana, and N. Batool, "Exploring the Writing Techniques of ELT Practitioners in Private and Public Schools," *Int. J. Innov. Creat. Chang.*, vol. 15, no. 3, pp. 823–838, 2021.
- [11] M. Arifin and M. L. Al Halim, "Cooperative Type Number Head Together (Nht) With Question Card Media in Learning Tenses," *Karang. J. Bid. Kependidikan, Pembelajaran, dan Pengemb.*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 44–50, 2021, doi: 10.55273/karangan.v3i1.87.
- [12] Gendroyono, "The Improvement of Students' Ability in Writing Procedure Text Through Picture Series," *J. Pendidik. Indones.*, vol. 2, no. 6, pp. 993–1023, 2021, doi: 10.36418/japendi.v2i6.201.
- [13] N. P. D. Dewi, D. Hermawan, and D. R. Putri, "Multimedia in Picture Series As Teaching Strategy in Encouraging English Learning Motivation To Bengkulu Elementary Students," *Yavana Bhasha J. English Lang. Educ.*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 165–175, 2022, doi: 10.25078/yb.v5i2.1160.
- [14] A. Wright, "Pictures for Language Learning (Cambridge Handbook for Language Teachers)." Cambridge University Press, p. 116, 1990.
- [15] A. W. L. Alice Oshima, Ann Hogue, *Introduction to Academic Writing, Second Edition (The Longman Academic Writing Series)*. Addison Wesley Publishing Company, 1996. doi: 10.4324/9781351005906-3.
- [16] C. Annisa, M. Melani, and V. Roza, "The Effect of Using Picture Series toward Students' Speaking Skill at the Second Grade in MTSS Nagari Binjai," *Pop. J. Penelit. Mhs.*, vol. 1, no. 4, pp. 19–33, 2022.
- [17] A. R. Eliyawati, I. Isnaini, T. Rohmah, and M. F. Matin, "The Implamantation of Picture Series as Learning Media to Improve The Studets' Ability in Writing Descriptive Text of The First Grade Students at MTS Daruth Thalibin of Academic Year 2021/2022," *J. Pendidik. Edutama*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 1–10, 2022.
- [18] S. Cristine, "The Effect of Picture Series in Writing Recount Text in SMPN 1 Malinau Barat," *Borneo Educ. J.*, vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 23–30, 2019, doi: 10.24903/bej.v1i2.612.
- [19] D. E. Silalahi, P. S. R. Sihombing, and L. Purba, "High Order Thinking Skill (Hots) Questions on Learners' Writing Ability of Report Text At Efl of Fkip Universitas Hkbp Nommensen," *J. Din. Pendidik.*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 17–32, 2021, doi: 10.33541/jdp.v14i1.1295.
- [20] A. P. Vanesa and P. Setiawati, "Using Pictures as Teaching Media in Writing Descriptive Text," *English Educ. Appl. Linguist. J.*, vol. 4, pp. 58–66, 2021.
- [21] A. D. Almu Bakrin, Aunurrahman, "The Effectiveness of Using Blog in Teaching Writing Skill," *Proc. 2nd Int. Conf. Lit. Educ.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 29–41, 2017.
- [22] J. W. Creswel, *Research design : qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*, 4th ed. SAGE, 2017.
- [23] H. L. Jacobs *et al.*, *Testing ESL composition : a practical approach*. 1981.
- [24] Z. H. Fitri, S. Farmasari, and A. D. Azis, "The Implementation of Picture Series in Teaching Writing Procedural Text at Tenth Grade of SMAN 1 Sakra," *JEEF (Journal English Educ. Forum)*, vol. 2, pp. 22–27, 2022.
- [25] A. W. Ramadhanty, D. W. Utomo, and J. Mayasari, "The Impact of Picture Series on Writing Ability Among Indonesian Junior High School Efl Learners," *J. English Acad. Specif. Purp.*, vol. 4, no. 2, pp. 254–260, 2021, doi: 10.18860/jeasp.v4i2.14431.

article fira

ORIGINALITY REPORT

19%

SIMILARITY INDEX

18%

INTERNET SOURCES

16%

PUBLICATIONS

12%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

| | | |
|---|-----------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 1 | Submitted to Universitas Muhammadiyah Sidoarjo Student Paper | 8% |
| 2 | jeef.unram.ac.id Internet Source | 3% |
| 3 | archive.umsida.ac.id Internet Source | 2% |
| 4 | www.ijrrjournal.com Internet Source | 1% |
| 5 | lppm.uhn.ac.id Internet Source | 1% |
| 6 | etheses.iainponorogo.ac.id Internet Source | 1% |
| 7 | ijemd.umsida.ac.id Internet Source | 1% |
| 8 | digilib.unila.ac.id Internet Source | 1% |
| 9 | journal.unimar-amni.ac.id Internet Source | 1% |

10

Submitted to Northcentral

Student Paper

1 %

11

digilib.uinkhas.ac.id

Internet Source

1 %

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches < 1%

Exclude bibliography On